

NOTRE DAME LAW REVIEW



Volume 84 Number 1

November 2008

CONTENTS

ARTICLES

- Climate Change Confusion and the Supreme Court:
The Misguided Regulation of Greenhouse Gas
Emissions Under the Clean Air Act *Jason Scott Johnston* 1
- Corporate Misconduct and the Perfect Storm
of Shareholder Litigation *Jessica Erickson* 75
- Why Protect Private Arms Possession? Nine
Theories of the Second Amendment *Michael Steven Green* 131
- The Fundamental Goal of Antitrust:
Protecting Consumers, Not
Increasing Efficiency *John B. Kirkwood* 191
Robert H. Lande
- What Is the *Erie* Doctrine? (And What Does
It Mean for the Contemporary Politics
of Judicial Federalism?) *Adam N. Steinman* 245

Opting Out of the Internet in the United States and the European Union: Copyright, Safe Harbors, and International Law	<i>Hannibal Travis</i>	331
The Foundations of the American Common Market	<i>Norman R. Williams</i>	409

N O T E

The Root of All Evil: Expanding Criminal Liability for Providing Material Support to Terror	<i>James J. Ward</i>	471
---	----------------------	-----

The *Notre Dame Law Review* (ISSN 0745-3515) is published five times annually by the Notre Dame Law School. Subscription rates are as follows: one-year subscription, \$45.00; two-year subscription, \$85.00; three-year subscription, \$120.00; five-year subscription, \$200.00; single issue \$15.00. Add \$5.00 annually for foreign surface mailing.

Address all correspondence concerning subscriptions to the Business Manager. Subscriptions will be automatically renewed unless a subscriber requests the Business Manager to discontinue the subscription. Notifications of address change should include both old and new addresses, with zip codes. Please allow at least one month for changes to become effective.

Editorial and Business Address: *Notre Dame Law Review*, Notre Dame Law School, Room B-1, Notre Dame, Indiana 46556. Telephone: (574) 631-7097; Fax: (574) 631-6379; E-mail: ndlrev@nd.edu.

POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *Notre Dame Law Review*, Notre Dame Law School, Room B-012, Notre Dame, Indiana 46556. Periodical postage is paid at Notre Dame, Indiana, and at additional mailing offices.

The *Notre Dame Law Review* invites the submission of unsolicited manuscripts, which should conform to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (18th ed. 2005). Only finished manuscripts are considered for publication. Regrettably, manuscripts cannot be returned unless a self-addressed stamped envelope is included.

The views expressed are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the policies or opinions of the *Notre Dame Law Review*, its editors and staff, the Notre Dame Law School, or the University of Notre Dame.

Copyright © 2008 by the *Notre Dame Law Review*. Individuals and nonprofit institutions may reproduce and distribute copies of the pieces herein in any format, at or below cost, for educational purposes, so long as each copy provides a citation to the *Notre Dame Law Review*, identifies the author, and includes this copyright notice.

For additional information about the *Notre Dame Law Review*, please visit our website at <http://www.ndlawreview.org>.

NOTRE DAME LAW REVIEW

KENDALL W. HANNON, CALIFORNIA
Editor in Chief

EMILY J. FOLLAS, INDIANA
Executive Editor

STEPHEN J. WALLACE, NEW YORK, <i>Executive Production Editor</i>	MAXWELL GOSS, MICHIGAN <i>Executive Articles Editor</i>	MEAGHAN HINES, KENTUCKY <i>Executive Managing Editor</i>
EDWARD T. HIGHBERGER, OKLAHOMA <i>Executive Issue Editor</i>	NICOLE M. LUNN, NEW YORK <i>Executive Issue Editor</i>	MICHAEL SKOKNA, ILLINOIS <i>Executive Issue Editor</i>

ELIZABETH ZWICKERT TIMMERMANS,
SOUTH CAROLINA
Executive Issue Editor

ALEXIS J. ZOUHARY, OHIO
Executive Notes Editor

PETER M. LADWEIN, ILLINOIS <i>Articles Submission Editor</i>	JULIE MARIE BAWOROWSKY, ILLINOIS <i>Federal Courts, Practice & Procedure Editor</i>	JAMES J. WARD, FLORIDA <i>Symposium Editor</i>
--	---	--

DANIEL BRAUN, INDIANA
Production Editor

SHERYN ALEXANDER, PENNSYLVANIA <i>Article Editor</i>	DAVID L. CULBERG, INDIANA <i>Article Editor</i>	TIMOTHY J. FIORTA, OHIO <i>Article Editor</i>
BENJAMIN M. LEPAK, OKLAHOMA <i>Article Editor</i>	STEPHEN W. MILLER, NEW YORK <i>Article Editor</i>	JASON RAWNSLEY, NEW JERSEY <i>Article Editor</i>
CARLO L. RODES, CALIFORNIA <i>Article Editor</i>	JACK BRILL, NEW YORK <i>Note Editor</i>	BLAKE ZOLLAR, CALIFORNIA <i>Article Editor</i>
	SAMIR H. PATEL, NEW JERSEY <i>Note Editor</i>	KATHERINE R. WHELEHAN, MARYLAND <i>Note Editor</i>

JONATHAN SCOTT BAKER, ILLINOIS	MARK A. HILL, ILLINOIS
BENJAMIN J. BEITER, VIRGINIA	BENJAMIN A. HUFFMAN, INDIANA
JOHN G. BERGER, JR., ILLINOIS	MICHAEL W. KELLEY, OHIO
ERIN M. BROWN, MICHIGAN	BONNIE A. KELLMAN, CALIFORNIA
ELIZABETH M. BUX, OHIO	JENNIE L. LOVE, NEW YORK
PRESTON N. CARTER, IDAHO	CARLI A. MCNEILL, WISCONSIN
MICHAEL J. CHAMBLISS, ILLINOIS	JOHN A. MEISER, TEXAS
MATTHEW W. CLARK, MICHIGAN	EMILY M. RECTOR, MICHIGAN
KENNETH G. COFFIN, NEW YORK	ALLYSON C. SPACHT, NEW YORK
C. NICHOLAS CURCIO, VIRGINIA	ALEX STEGE, KENTUCKY
MICHAEL P. DAVEY, OREGON	ZACHARY J. SULLIVAN, OREGON
BENJAMIN ELLISON, INDIANA	KATHERINE D. VITALE, NEW JERSEY
MICHAEL J. GERARDI, CALIFORNIA	

Members

ANTHONY J. BELLIA JR.
Faculty Advisor

BONNIE K. GRIMSLID
Business Manager

Dedicated to Our Lady, Mirror of Justice

UNIVERSITY OF NOTRE DAME
ADMINISTRATION

REV. JOHN I. JENKINS, C.S.C.,
D.PHIL.
President of the University
THOMAS G. BURISH, PH.D.
Provost
JOHN AFFLECK-GRAVES, PH.D.
Executive Vice President
ROBERT J. BERNHARD, PH.D.
Vice President for Research
DENNIS C. JACOBS, PH.D.
Vice President and Associate Provost
CAROL COLBY KAESBIER, J.D.
Vice President and General Counsel
JAMES J. LYPHOUT, M.B.A.,
Vice President for Business Operations
SCOTT C. MALPASS, M.B.A.
Vice President and Chief Investment Officer
CHRISTINE M. MAZIAR, PH.D.
Vice President and Senior Associate Provost
LOUIS M. NANNI, M.A.
Vice President for University Relations
REV. MARK L. POORMAN, C.S.C.,
PH.D.
Vice President for Student Affairs
DONALD POPE-DAVIS, PH.D.
Vice President and Associate Provost
JOHN A. SEJDINAJ, M.B.A.
Vice President for Finance

NOTRE DAME LAW SCHOOL
ADMINISTRATION

PATRICIA A. O'HARA, B.A., J.D.
The Joseph A. Matson Dean and Professor of Law
JOHN H. ROBINSON, B.A., M.A., J.D.
Executive Associate Dean and Associate Professor of Law; Acting Dean for Students
MARGARET BRINIG, B.A., M.A.,
PH.D., J.D.
Associate Dean for Faculty Research and Fritz Duda Family Chair in Law
EDWARD P. EDMONDS, J.D.
Director of the Kresge Law Library, Associate Dean for Library and Information Technology, and Professor of Law
WILLIAM KELLEY, B.A., J.D.
Associate Dean and Associate Professor of Law
GAIL G. PESHEL, J.D.
Assistant Dean for Students; Acting Director of Career Services
M. CATHERINE ROEMER, B.A.
Assistant Dean for Law School Administration

THE LAW SCHOOL
FACULTY

CLAIRE KONOPA AIGOTTI, B.A., J.D.
Associate Vice President and Counsel and Concurrent Professor of Law
AMY CONEY BARRETT, B.A., J.D.
Associate Professor of Law
MATTHEW J. BARRETT, B.B.A., J.D.
Professor of Law
JOSEPH P. BAUER, B.A., J.D.
Professor of Law
ANTHONY J. BELLIA, JR., B.A., J.D.
Professor of Law and Notre Dame Presidential Fellow
PATRICIA L. BELLIA, A.B., J.D.
Professor of Law and Notre Dame Presidential Fellow
G. ROBERT BLAKEY, B.A., J.D.
William and Dorothy O'Neill Chair in Law
MEREDITH J. BOWERS, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law
GERARD V. BRADLEY, B.A., J.D.
Professor of Law (on leave Spring 2009)
MARGARET F. BRINIG, B.A., M.A.,
PH.D., J.D.
Associate Dean for Faculty Development Fritz Duda Family Chair in Law
THOMAS F. BRODEN, LL.B., J.D.
Professor of Law Emeritus
BARBARA A. BROOK, B.S., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law
LESLIE D. CALLAHAN, A.B., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law
ALEJANDRO CAMACHO, B.A., J.D.,
LL.M.
Associate Professor of Law
PAOLO G. CAROZZA, A.B., J.D.
Associate Professor of Law
DOUGLASS CASSEL, B.A., J.D.
Notre Dame Presidential Fellow, Professor of Law and Director, Center for Civil and Human Rights
LISA L. CASEY, A.B., J.D.
Associate Professor of Law
LAUREL P. COCHRANE, B.A., M.L.S.
Associate Librarian
JOHN A. CONWAY, B.S., J.D.
Adjunct Professor of Law
REV. JOHN J. COUGHLIN, O.F.M.,
B.A., M.A., TH.M., J.D., J.C.L.,
J.C.D.
Professor of Law
JEANETTE COX, B.A., J.D.
Visiting Assistant Professor of Law
FERNAND W. DUTILE, A.B., J.D.
Professor of Law

ALEXANDER L. EDGAR, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

EDWARD P. EDMONDS, B.A., M.S.,
J.D.
*Director of the Kresge Law Library, Associate
Dean for Library and Information Technology,
and Professor of Law*

BARBARA J. FICK, B.A., J.D.
Associate Professor of Law

JOHN M. FINNIS, LL.B., D.PHIL.
Barrister
*Biolchini Family Professor of Law, University
of Notre Dame/FBA*

TIMOTHY J. FLANAGAN, B.S., J.D.
*Assistant Vice President and Counsel and
Concurrent Assistant Professor of Law*

JUDITH FOX, B.S., J.D.
Associate Clinical Professor of Law

KARI GALLAGHER, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

RAYMOND E. GALLAGHER, A.B., J.D.
Visiting Professor of Law

JOHN N. GALLO, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

NICOLE STELLE GARNETT, A.B., J.D.
Professor of Law

RICHARD W. GARNETT, B.A., J.D.
Professor of Law

FREDERICK M. GEDICKS, B.A., J.D.
Visiting Professor of Law

JEANINE M. GOZDECKI, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

AMY J. GRIFFIN, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

WILLIAM T. GRIMMER, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

ALAN GUNN, B.S., J.D.
John N. Matthews Professor of Law Emeritus

JIMMY GURULÉ, B.A., J.D.
Professor of Law

JAMES D. HALL, B.S., J.D.
Adjunct Associate Professor of Law

WILLIAM P. HOYE, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
Adjunct Associate Professor of Law

LOWELL KENT HULL, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Associate Professor of Law

LOIS C. JACKSON, B.A., J.D.
*Assistant Vice President and Counsel and
Concurrent Assistant Professor of Law*

ROGER F. JACOBS, A.B., J.D.,
M.A.L.S.
*Director Emeritus of the Kresge Law Library,
Associate Dean and Professor of Law Emeritus*

MICHAEL JENUWINE, B.S., M.A.,
PH.D., J.D.
Associate Clinical Professor of Law

VINCENT R. JOHNSON, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Professor of Law

ROBERT L. JONES, JR., B.A., J.D.
*Director, Notre Dame Legal Aid Clinic and
Clinical Professor of Law*

HON. JEANNE JOURDAN, A.B., J.D.
Adjunct Professor of Law

M. CATHLEEN KAVENY, A.B., M.A.,
M.PHIL., J.D., PH.D.
*John P. Murphy Foundation Chair in Law
and Professor of Theology*

CONRAD L. KELLENBERG, A.B., J.D.
Professor of Law Emeritus

WILLIAM K. KELLEY, B.A., J.D.
Associate Dean and Associate Professor of Law

DWIGHT B. KING, JR., B.A., J.D.,
M.L.S.
Librarian and Head of Research Services

CARMELA R. KINSLOW, B.S., M.L.S.,
M.S.A.
*Associate Librarian and Head of Access
Services*

MICHAEL S. KIRSCH, A.B., J.D.,
LL.M.
Associate Professor of Law

SANDRA S. KLEIN, B.A., M.ED.,
M.S.L.I.S.
Associate Librarian for Technical Services

DONALD P. KOMMERS, B.A., M.A.,
PH.D., LL.D.
*Joseph and Elizabeth Robbie Professor of
Political Science and Concurrent Professor of
Law Emeritus*

ROBERT J. KUEHN, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

JOHN LADUE, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

TANG THI THANH TRAIL LÊ, PH.D.,
J.D.
*Professor of Law Emerita, License en Droit,
Doctorat en Droit,, University of Aix-Marseille*

DAVID T. LINK, B.S., J.D.
*Joseph A. Matson Dean Emeritus and Professor
of Law Emeritus*

KATHLEEN MARIE MARCUS, B.A.,
J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

HON. JOHN M. MARNOCHA, B.A.,
J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

JENNIFER M. MASON MCAWARD,
B.A., J.D.
Associate Professor of Law

LLOYD H. MAYER, A.B., J.D.
Associate Professor of Law

MARK MCKENNA, B.A., J.D.
Associate Professor of Law

WILLIAM O. MCLEAN, B.S., M.S.,
M.A.
Associate Dean Emeritus

TARA J. MELISH, B.A., J.D.
Visiting Assistant Professor

HON. JANE W. MILLER, A.B., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

DANIEL R. MURRAY, A.B., J.D.
Adjunct Associate Professor of Law

RICHARD S. MYERS, B.A., J.D.
Visiting Professor of Law

JOHN COPELAND NAGLE, B.A., J.D.
John N. Matthews Chair in Law

SEAN O'BRIEN, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
Assistant Director, Center for Civil and Human Rights and Concurrent Assistant Professor of Law

CHRISTOPHER O'BYRNE, B.A., M.A., J.D., M.L.I.S.
Assistant Librarian,

MARY ELLEN O'CONNELL, B.A., M.SC., LL.B., J.D.
Robert and Marion Short Chair in Law

PATTI J. OGDEN, B.A., J.D., M.L.S.
Librarian

PATRICIA A. O'HARA, B.A., J.D.
The Joseph A. Matson Dean and Professor of Law

KEVIN O'REAR, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

ROBERT J. PALMER, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

PAUL J. PERALTA, B.S., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

WALTER F. PRATT, JR., B.A., D.PHIL., J.D.
Professor of Law Emeritus

DAVID R. PRUITT, B.S., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

ROBERT J. PUSHAW, B.A., J.D.
Visiting Professor of Law

MAURA F. RATIGAN, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

WARREN D. REES, B.A., J.D., A.M.L.S.
Librarian

CHARLES E. RICE, B.A., J.D., LL.M., J.S.D.
Professor of Law Emeritus

HON. KENNETH F. RIPPLE, A.B., J.D., LL.M., LL.D.
Professor of Law

JOHN H. ROBINSON, B.A., M.A., PH.D., J.D.
Executive Associate Dean and Associate Professor of Law; Acting Dean of Students

ROBERT E. RODES, JR., A.B., J.D.
Paul J. Schierl/Fort Howard Corporation Chair in Legal Ethics

VINCENT D. ROUGEAU, A.B., J.D.
Associate Professor of Law

PATRICK A. SALVI, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

HON. MICHAEL SCOPELITIS, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

JAMES H. SECKINGER, B.S., M.S., J.D.
Professor of Law

THOMAS L. SHAFFER, B.A., J.D., LL.D.
Robert and Marion Short Professor of Law Emeritus

MICHELLE T. SHAKOUR, B.A., M.A., M.S., J.D.
Director of Planned Giving and Concurrent Assistant Professor of Law

JANE M. SIMON, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

ANDREA SIMONCINI
2008-09 US/Italy Fulbright Chair

KATHERINE E. SINGER, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

THOMAS A. SINGER, A.B., LL.B.
Adjunct Professor of Law

STEPHEN F. SMITH, B.A., J.D.
Visiting Professor of Law

J. ERIC SMITHBURN, B.S., M.A., J.D.
Professor of Law

CARTER SNEAD, B.A., J.D.
Associate Professor of Law

D. ANDREW SPALDING, A.B., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

EDWARD A. SULLIVAN III, B.A., J.D.,
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

JOSEPH W. THOMAS, B.A., M.A.L.S.
Librarian and Head of Technical Services

JAY TIDMARSH, A.B., J.D.
Professor of Law

JULIAN VELASCO, B.S., J.D.
Associate Professor of Law

CHRISTINE VENTER, B.A., LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D.
Director, Legal Writing Program

JOEL WILLIAMS, B.A., J.D.
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Law

LONDON LAW FACULTY

JOHN N. ADAMS, LL.B.
Barrister
Professor of Law, Sheffield University

EFSTHATHIOS KONSTANTINOU
BANAKAS, LL.M., PH.D.
Senior Lecturer in Law, University of East Anglia

GEOFFREY J. BENNETT, M.A.
Barrister
Director, Notre Dame London Law Programme,
and Professor of Law
PENNY DARBYSHIRE, B.A., M.A.,
PH.D.
Senior Lecturer in Law, Kingston University
MARTA HAINES-FERRARI, LL.B.,
M.A.
Fellow in Latin American Law, The British
Institute of International & Comparative Law
SUSAN HAWKER, LL.B., LL.M.
Barrister
Senior Lecturer in Law, London Guildhall
University
JANE E. HENDERSON, LL.B., LL.M.
Senior Lecturer in Laws of Eastern Europe,
King's College, London
MARGOT HORSPOOL, LL.B., LL.M.
Professor Emerita of European and
Comparative Law, University of Surrey
MATHEW HUMPHREYS, LL.B., PH.D.
Senior Lecturer in Law and Head of
Department, Kingston University
DAVID IBBETSON, B.A., PH.D.
Fellow of Corpus Christi College and Regius
Chair of Civil Law, University of Cambridge

CATHERINE JENKINS, M.A., LL.M.
D.E.S.U.
Solicitor, Director, Centre for Law and Conflict,
School of Oriental and African Studies,
University of London
MICHAEL PALMER, B.SC. M.A., LL.B.
Professor of Law and Director, Centre of East
Asian Law, School of Oriental and African
Studies, University of London
KATHERINE REECE-THOMAS, B.A.,
LL.M.
Solicitor, Director, Centre for Law and Conflict,
School of Oriental and African Studies,
University of London
CARLA MUNOZ SLAUGHTER, B.A.,
J.D., LL.M.
Adjunct Associate Professor, University of Notre
Dame
PETER E. SLINN, M.A., PH.D.
Solicitor, Senior Lecturer in Law, School of
Oriental and African Studies, University of
London
ANN STANIC, LL.B., LL.M.
Solicitor

THE NOTRE DAME LAW SCHOOL

The Notre Dame Law School is the oldest Roman Catholic law school in the United States, celebrating its 135th year of continuous operation in 2004. Its national program is designed to equip a student to practice law in every state and in several foreign nations. The school is committed to exploring moral and religious questions raised in legal studies. The Notre Dame program aims to educate men and women to become lawyers of extraordinary professional competence who possess a partisanship for justice, an ability to respond to human need, and a compassion for their clients and colleagues. The learning program is geared to skill and service.

THE LONDON PROGRAM

The Notre Dame Law School is the only law school in the United States that offers study abroad for credit on both a summer and a year-round basis. Both American and English teachers instruct at Notre Dame's own London Law Centre. The study and research needs of the London students are assured through arrangements with nearby libraries, including the Institute for Advanced Legal Studies of the University of London and the library of Middle Temple, one of the Inns of Court in London. Additionally, readers may be admitted to the internationally renowned Bodleian Library at Oxford provided that they fulfill the normal requirements for readership.

JOINT DEGREE PROGRAM

The law school offers a M.B.A./J.D. Program, a combined four-year program of study leading to the degrees of master of business administration and juris doctor. Where appropriate and with the approval of the particular department, other joint degree programs may be fashioned to suit individual interests or needs—for example, law and engineering or law and history.

THE NOTRE DAME LAW REVIEW

The *Notre Dame Lawyer* was organized in 1925. In 1981, the staff of the *Lawyer*, after consulting with alumni of the publication, decided to change the publication's name from the *Lawyer* to the *Notre Dame Law Review*. Citations to the journal prior to volume 58 should appear as NOTRE DAME LAW. Citations to volume 58 and after should appear as NOTRE DAME L. REV.

Each year the *Law Review* publishes one volume, appearing in five separate issues between October and June. One issue of each volume, *Federal Courts, Practice & Procedure*, represents a forum for exploring civil practice and procedure in the federal courts.