

Submitting Engineer's Name: _____

Rating (out of 30 pts) _____

-
1. Brief summary of purpose and goals of study [3] _____
 - 0 - no mention of purpose
 - 1 - purpose implied but not explicit
 - 2 - purpose stated but not specific or useful to assess role of study
 - 3 - clear statement of purpose and anticipated influence of study on design

 2. Description of quantitative information sources used in the study [3] _____
 - 0 - no mention of sources of information (analysis, simulation, experiment, etc.)
 - 1 - some indication of sources but no mention of assumptions or limitations on info
 - 2 - indication of sources but no mention of assumptions or limitations on info
 - 3 - effective description of information sources, assumptions and limitations on information

 3. Explicit statement of design and behavioral (state) variables [3] _____
 - 0 - no obvious consideration of these concepts
 - 1 - an indication of one or the other but not both
 - 2 - a "shopping list" of either or both and difficult to determine which were used in the study
 - 3 - effective identification of both design variables and states used in the study

 4. Explicit statements of constraints on states and DV [3] _____
 - 0 - no obvious consideration of these concepts
 - 1 - some, qualitative only, indication of constraints on states or DVs
 - 2 - some quantitative constraints indicated for states and DVs
 - 3 - effective justification of useful constraints for appropriate states and DVs

 5. Presentation of the information gathered (i.e. the results) [3] _____
 - 0 - no explicit presentation of results from analysis, simulation or other information sources
 - 1 - presented only "raw data" or data without appropriate units, legends, sources
 - 2 - excessive or inadequate data/information but effectively presented
 - 3 - concise tabular or graphical presentation with labels and legend that support results

 6. Discussion of the usefulness and accuracy information (i.e. the results) [9] _____
 - 0 - no discussion
 - 3 - general discussion of results
 - 6 - some use of the information to identify trends but identification of key issues left to reader
 - 9 - concise discussion that highlights key issues/trends effectively substantiated by information provided

 7. Discussion of the influence of the results (i.e. decisions made) [3] _____
 - 0 - no mention of impact of study on concept design
 - 1 - some attempt but unable to identify how the design was influenced
 - 2 - indication of impact but no justification based upon information included in the study
 - 3 - concise statement of influence study (positive or negative) and quantitative validation

 8. Overall presentation of study [3] _____
 - 0 - lacks format, organization or structure
 - 1 - some structure but "fluffy" text and vague descriptions of key issues or poor proofreading
 - 2 - reasonable structure, effective written text, inadequate proof reading, not concise, too long
 - 3 - study is appropriate for review at higher levels of the organization