

education that leads the will to good choices. The play of private desire turns out badly for many because we lack a lively sense of the common good where concepts such as *justice* and the *true ends of human life* govern economic behavior. Briefly entering the classic discussion of the ethics of property, Cavanaugh says that ownership must serve the common good so that it does not become a means of power over others. Though he does not use the classic slogan, he surely would agree that “right use determines right ownership.”

Cavanaugh finds the common good served most powerfully when we really identify with others in a solidarity so profound that we feel one another’s pain and become, as St. Paul said, truly members one of another; for Cavanaugh the ultimate model of that unity is the Eucharist, in which the partakers all become one in the same body of Christ, which he extends to mean the whole human community. Following von Balthasar, he says we do not lose our individuality in this communion, yet our empathetic distance from others collapses to nothing. Consequently, we cannot discharge our obligation to the weak by simple gifts of charity; a more profound identification is required. One of his sentences in particular lands a solid punch to the complacent: “Those of us who partake in the Eucharist while ignoring the hungry may be eating and drinking our own damnation.”

Put succinctly, then, as Cavanaugh does right at the start, the book argues that an economy must be judged by its ability to enhance “communion among persons and between persons and God.” Valid economic exchanges are those in which we see the other as part of the same body of Christ. It is a lofty goal, and he tells us how to pursue it for ourselves. What the larger economy will or can do is another matter.

—Thomas Sieger Derr

Smith College, Northampton, Massachusetts

**A Promised Land, a Perilous Journey:  
Theological Perspectives on Migration**  
**Daniel G. Groody and Gioacchino Campese (Editors)**  
Notre Dame, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press,  
2008 (332 pages)

Debate over immigration, particularly illegal or undocumented immigration along the southern border of the United States, has been highly contentious during the last few years. There is no reason to think that the controversy will abate any time soon, especially in difficult economic circumstances. Daniel Groody and Gioacchino Campese enter this conversation as theologians who have lived and worked with the poor on both sides of the U.S.-Mexico border. They desire to bring the human face of the immigrant to the fore of the discussion, and they succeeded spectacularly in their must-see video, *Dying to Live: A Migrant’s Journey*.

In addition to their “pastoral interest in the plight of immigrants,” Groody and Campese want to build, “a more solid conceptual grounding of theology and migration” (xix).

## Reviews

*A Promised Land*, a collection of seventeen essays, provides, they hope, a foundation on which a theology of immigration, with particular focus on borders—both physical and metaphorical—can develop: “Building on the methodology of other praxis-based theologies, one of [the] central goals [of the book] is to propose a theology of immigration based on the experience of immigrants and the reality of immigration” (xxii). Although the book situates itself primarily on the Mexican-American border, the arguments developed have universal application.

Three observations are in order before I delve into specifics: The book should be read by anyone interested in acquiring a deeper grasp of the complex issues surrounding the border and immigration; it succeeds in its task of proposing a theology growing out of the experience of immigrants; and its other goal of developing such a theology within the reality of immigration is underdeveloped, with the effects of immigration on both the sending and receiving communities only tangentially touched.

The book is divided into four parts. The five chapters of part 1 provide the foundations for a theology of immigration. In chapter 1, Jacqueline Hagan describes the religious rituals practiced by immigrants, both Catholic and Protestant, as they prepare for and journey northward. In the next two chapters, Donald Senior and Peter C. Phan place modern migration within the context of a pilgrim Church and a pilgrim people, focusing on biblical—specifically New Testament—perspectives and the patristic era respectively. In chapter 4, Alex Nova provocatively explores the paradox of the desert in Christian imagery and immigrant lives. “As I look across the expanse of the Sonoran desert—its garden-like terrain and awesome immensity—I’m filled with ambivalence,” she writes. “I witness beauty everywhere and yet also hear the laments of immigrants burnt by the sun. It’s a tragic beauty that I recognize, a beauty that attests to the contradictory and ambiguous face of the human experience” (73). Gustavo Gutiérrez completes part 1 with his analysis of the immigration question from the perspective of the Church’s call to live a preferential option for the poor.

Part 2’s five chapters focus mainly on the special pastoral issues that arise within the migrant community. Chapter 6, by Steven Evans, explores the mission of the Church and the importance of not only ministering to migrants but getting them involved in ministry as well. He writes, “The image of the ‘Border Christ’ that stands outside the parish church of St. Pius X in El Paso is an image of the church of migrants as the body of Christ” (99). Immigrants—like the rest of us but perhaps for different reasons—are broken people in need of reconciliation with God and others. After all, most people do not risk their lives to cross a desert and a border where they are not legally welcome unless their lives are broken. Therefore, Robert Schreiter’s contribution, which focuses on reconciliation, appropriately follows Evans’.

In chapter 8, Giovanni Graziano Tassello offers John Baptist Scalabrini (1839–1905) and his followers, the Scalabrinians, as models for how to live out the Church’s mission of providing love and healing for migrants. Chapters 9 and 10 contextualize the hopes and challenges of ministering to immigrants at the border and in the interior of the United States. Patrick Murphy invites us into his world of ministering to the growing Hispanic

community in the Kansas City area, and Robin Hoover surveys the ecumenical work of a civic organization, Humane Borders, which provides direct aid to immigrants crossing the desert.

The four chapters of part 3 explore “the politics of sovereign rights, cultural rights, and human rights” (viii). In chapter 11, Graziano Battistella outlines various ethical foundations for human dignity, preferring a relational one to “a human rights approach,” which tends to emphasize the individual to the exclusion of authentic dignity, universal common good, and solidarity (190). Recognizing that “[l]egal norms will invariably fall short of rights rooted in human dignity” (192), Donald Kerwin goes on to expose various ways in which U.S. immigration law and policy fail to provide adequately for the natural rights of immigrants. Raúl Fornet-Betancourt’s chapter, “Hermeneutics and Politics of Strangers,” addresses the philosophical challenges to what he calls *convivencia*, or living together and celebrating life together in a multicultural society. Olivia Ruiz Marrujo closes this section with a chapter on the special vulnerabilities of undocumented migrant women, focusing particularly on sexual violence.

Part 4’s three chapters take different approaches to developing constructive theologies of immigration. In chapter 15, Jorge E. Castillo Guerra proposes “an intercultural method for a theology of migration,” growing organically out of the lived experience of the immigrants (264). Gioacchino Campese turns to the cross and the suffering Christ as a lens through which to view the suffering (and often death) of immigrants who cross the desert southwest in search of a better life. Finally, in one of the most thought-provoking chapters in the book, Daniel Groody invites the reader to frame a theology of immigration around the structure of the liturgy of the Eucharist. “As one looks more closely at the dynamics of immigration and the structure of the Eucharist,” he observes, “one can observe many connections between the breaking of the bread and the breaking of migrant’s bodies, between the pouring out of Christ’s blood for his people and the pouring out of migrants’ lives for their families, between Christ’s death and resurrection and migrants’ own. Immigrants, I believe, offer a new way of looking at the Eucharist, and the Eucharist in turn gives many immigrants a new way of understanding their struggles” (301).

Although I recommend the book, it does have one serious deficiency that is likely to alienate readers not already sympathetic to the plight of poor, undocumented immigrants who risk their lives to provide for their families. In the preface, the editors lament the “simplistic and politically charged” way in which much of immigration debate has been conducted in the United States: “These people . . . tend to forget or ignore that immigration is a complex issue that has no easy solutions.” They suggest that any “serious intellectual debate on immigration requires listening to all sides of the conversation in order to understand the concerns that all constituencies bring to the table” (xxi).

Yet, most of the contributors themselves fail to acknowledge the complexity of the issues. What responsibility do Mexican government and businesses bear for failing to provide the structure and infrastructure for adequate economic and personal development? What has the sending community lost when it loses valuable human resources to migration? What does the receiving country gain and lose economically and culturally

with the arrival of new migrants? Where is the balance between a country's sovereign right to control its borders and the right to emigrate?

Given the editors' desire to give voice to the migrant, such exploration might have been beyond the scope of the book. However, these questions could have been more widely acknowledged. Instead, a few contributors seem bent on alienating those who raise these questions. Two examples will suffice. Guerra writes that migration theologians discover two sides to the immigrant's plight. On the one side is "the migrant's faith, hope, and love." On the other is "xenophobia, racism, ethnocentrism, intolerance, and exclusion" working to marginalize the immigrant (260). In reference to U.S. border policy, Campese writes: "When is this slaughter going to end" (271)? He is irritated by the American government's claim that deaths in the desert are "unintended consequences" of this policy, calling this response "an excuse [by] those in power to avoid responsibility" (281).

*A Promised Land* is an important contribution to the development of a full and robust theology of migration. As this project goes forward, I encourage the editors of and contributors to the volume to acknowledge fully the nuances, complexities, and tensions in a Catholic understanding of immigration and to undertake the difficult task of dialoguing with those who in good faith arrive at different answers.

—Michael A. Scaperlanda (e-mail: mscaperlanda@ou.edu)  
*University of Oklahoma College of Law*

## After Modernity? Secularity, Globalization, and the Re-enchantment of the World

**James K. A. Smith (Editor)**

Waco, Texas: Baylor University Press, 2008 (333 pages)

Modernity, secularization, globalization, the resurgence of religion, the failures of capitalism and liberal democracy, ecological catastrophe, the political recognition of refugees, marine resource management, agrarianism, the future of Christianity—any *one* of these would surely be enough to focus the attention of an interdisciplinary group of academics. That James K. A. Smith, under the auspices of Calvin College's Seminars in Christian Scholarship, assembled a group of twelve philosophers, geographers, theologians, and economists to tackle them *all at once* was nothing if not ambitious. *After Modernity?: Secularity, Globalization and the Re-enchantment of the World* represents the fruit of this grand undertaking.

Contributors to the book include John Milbank and Graham Ward of the United Kingdom; Smith and Janel Curry of Calvin College (Grand Rapids, Michigan); Ronald Kuipers and Lambert Zuidervaart of the Institute for Christian Studies (Toronto); and a number of other professors with links to the Reformed tradition from American, British, and Canadian universities. What would seem to unify their various contributions are the common convictions: (1) that all is not well with modernity (in fact, very little